The Hawaiian Journal of History


Writer-historian John Demos has added another intriguing episode of American history to his impressive list of works, this time one touching on Hawai‘i.
Through a serendipitous conversation with a fellow dinner guest, he hears “just a piece of local history” which is grist for the mill for this professor emeritus at Yale University, lighting a spark of curiosity and eventually becoming *The Heathen School*. In his succinct prologue, he gives us the whole picture—the five W’s plus enough self-revelation to get us involved and satisfied that we have what we need to make sense of the story we are about to read and to locate it within the larger framework of American exceptionalism.

This is the story of a school for (mostly) indigenous youth from both America and distant lands located in Cornwall, Connecticut, site of the aforementioned dinner party. During the opening decades of the nineteenth century, as the efforts of Protestant missions to convert the world were reaching their zenith, Congregationalist movers and shakers in New England conceived of a school to bring the heathen to America for education, civilization and Christianization who would then return as missionaries and role models to their native lands. The spark that lit this fire was Hawaii’s own Henry ‘Ōpūkaha‘ia (Obookiah) whose piety, learning, and zeal to convert his countrymen inspired not only the creation of the Cornwall school, but also the Sandwich Islands Mission. No foreign missionary, it was argued, would be nearly so effective as an earnest, well-educated native who already spoke the local language and could navigate the culture from the moment of his return.

In the course of his research, the author also discovered that his own father had been a student in a “heathen school” located in Turkey, sponsored by the very same American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (ABCFM). Serendipity? Fate?

In order to understand the nineteenth century *zeitgeist* propelling the missionary minded, we are treated to a dash around the world of commerce, economics, politics, and philosophic-religious happenings. For instance, a description of the China trade takes us from Boston to the Falklands, to the island of Mas Afuera, from Fiji to Alaska, from Chile to the Philippines and on to Canton, the only Chinese port open to foreign traders. Hawai‘i is, of course, set in the middle of this web. Demos’ story starts with a global perspective and then turns to the school, its short life, and the factors that led to its untimely end.

For readers especially interested in Hawai‘i, the section on ‘Ōpūkaha‘ia (whom Demos regularly calls Obookiah) is particularly good. ‘Ōpūkaha‘ia was a remarkable man who inspired thousands of white people strongly inclined to dismiss dark-skinned “heathens” as not worthy of their attentions. Demos has presented a very human, but no less inspiring, ‘Ōpūkaha‘ia while avoiding both hagiography and cynicism. His accounts of the other Hawai‘ians, John Honoli‘i (Honoree), William Kanui (Tenooee), Thomas Hopu (Hopoo), and George Kaumuali‘i (Tamoree) are less helpful, especially
where he relies on Dr. Judd’s harsh dismissal of Hopu who, despite Judd, figured critically in the early success of the mission, even if his later behavior proved an embarrassment.

*The Heathen School* is arranged in four parts (I almost said “acts”): Beginnings, Ascent, Crisis, and Finale, each of which begins with an informative overview of the socio-political environment encompassing the events to be covered, a chapter or two relating the events themselves, and, for the first three parts/acts, an interlude wherein the author journeys to one of the three major scenes of his drama: Hawai‘i, Cornwall, and Cherokee country. The interludes are quite personal: the author shares his observations and imaginings with the reader, like the letters of a friend on a journey. These interludes also help to remind us that Demos, for all his historical research, is telling a story, not strictly writing a history of the Cornwall school, although there is much history to be gleaned from it.

Demos’ reputation as an engaging writer is well deserved, and those who want to know the basic story of the school, especially the story of ‘Ōpūkaha‘ia and its two famous Cherokee students, will find themselves both educated and entertained. It is the latter result, however, that causes the reader to wonder if some of his conclusions are, instead, assumptions. Like a good playwright, Demos works upon the prejudices of his audience. We expect to find racism and hypocrisy lurking in deeply religious people and this story does not disappoint. ABCFM missionaries were not untouched by the virulent racism of their day, and, like the rest of us, were sometimes hypocritical. What is problematic here is that they, unlike the other characters in the drama, are regularly held by the author to modern standards of race and conduct, while others, American townsfolk, politicians, and indigenous students, get off more lightly. The townsfolk of Cornwall proved to be incorrigible bigots, the politicians criminally so, and most of the indigenous students were easily turned from their missionary zeal once they returned home. We are not surprised by any of this, nor does the tragedy hinge on their human failures. The ABCFM leaders, on the other hand, nearly all of whom were head and shoulders above their contemporaries in regards to race and in their belief that “heathens” really were humans with minds that could be educated, are made into the stuff of tragedy, but only because they are not examined in the moral spotlight of their age, but of ours.

This drama starts with the subtitle “Hope and Betrayal.” Demos has connected some dubious dots to make this assertion. The Cornwall school proved to be unable to mass-produce Obookiais. The theory sounded good, but in the end, very few students proved to be effective missionaries, thus negating the real purpose of the school. When this became clear, the ABCFM cut its losses, farmed out the remaining students as best it could, and closed the school.
Demos, however, has taken this prosaic story and turned it into a tragedy in the classical sense. The protagonists, in this case the ABCFM, carried its fatal flaw within (racial hypocrisy), a flaw which ultimately led to the so-called betrayal. It is a gripping tragedy, but a dubious historical conclusion. Even the main title, *The Heathen School*, smacks of drama. This was a nickname used by some Cornwall residents. For the ABCFM, it was simply “The Cornwall School.”

*The Heathen School* has received numerous awards and positive reviews. Reviewer liked the book and so did I, but readers interested in Hawaiian history will do well to filter out some of Demos’ assertions of tragedy, betrayal, and even of American exceptionalism. The book does contain one shockingly tragic tale, the fate of two brilliant Cherokee scholars, but at the hands of their own people, not missionaries, and in Oklahoma, not Cornwall.

*Kapali Lyon,*  
*Assistant Professor of Religion  
University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa*

---

*Securing Paradise: Tourism and Militarism in Hawai‘i and the Philippines.*  

Imaginings of paradise long have worked to deny the legacies and persistence of the American empire in the Pacific, even as the U.S. military continues to maintain an active presence in its former colonies. In a critical study about the operations of militarism and tourism in Hawai‘i and the Philippines, Vernadette Vicuña Gonzalez reveals how these two forces have remained deeply imbricated to sustain American imperial dominance in the Pacific. These are not just incidental overlaps, she argues, but a “strategic and symbiotic convergence” in which the U.S. military has laid the foundations for tourist itineraries and imaginations, and the economies of modern tourism continue to justify the necessity of American security in the region (p. 4). In so doing, *Securing Paradise* tells us far more than the interplay of militarism and tourism in the American tropics. Pushing beyond the binaries of “soft” and “hard” power, “colonial” and “postcolonial” that continue to frame cultural histories of the U.S. empire, this innovative study presents a critical genealogy of the U.S. empire that situates histories of violence squarely within the “liberating” narratives and practices of consumer freedom, multiculturalism, and neoliberal development.
The Heathen School is a provocative addition to recent narrative histories that explore how racial categories and attitudes have changed over time in America. - Maureen Corrigan, NPR Books

"I consider John Demos a superbly gifted scholar and writer . . . the appearance of this finely crafted, fascinating book can be a reason for celebration.Â - Clyde A. Milner II, The History Book Club

"A complex account of a number of linked episodes in American history and their tragic aftermath . . . It is in noticing countercurrents, complexities, and contradictions that Demos"s greatness as a historian lies, and his consideration of all aspects of unfolding events shows to truly arresting effect in the rest of the story told here. . . Such scrupulousness, erudition, and talent." The Heathen School is a provocative addition to recent narrative histories that explore how racial categories and attitudes have changed over time in America.

"Maureen Corrigan, NPR Books Âœ consider John Demos a superbly gifted scholar and writer . . . the appearance of this finely crafted, fascinating book can be a reason for celebration.Â The book is outstanding in many ways. Primary among them, it is beautifully written Âœ the mixing of DemosÂ™ craftsmanship and early melodious borrowed quotes . . . wonderfully executed impressions of his personal sojourns around todayÂ™s Cornwall and Hawaii. As the professor reminds us, The Heathen School was at one point Âœ poised on the threshold of a new project, whose aim was nothing less than to save the world.Â™Âœ Longlisted for the 2014 National Book Award

The astonishing story of a unique missionary project and the America it embodied from award-winning historian John Demos. Near the start of the nineteenth century, as the newly established United States looked outward toward the wider world, a group of eminent Protestant ministers formed a grand scheme for gathering the rest of mankind into the redemptive fold of Christianity and civilization. Its core element Read Full Overview.